THE INFLUENCE OF CUSTOMER RELATIONSHIP MANAGEMENT TOWARD CUSTOMER LOYALTY IN PT BANK NEGARA INDONESIA MANADO

by:
Monika Pangkey 1
David Paul E. Saerang 2

1, 2 Faculty of Economics and Business
International Business Administration (IBA), Management Program
University of Sam Ratulangi
Manado email:
momonpangkey@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

New Economy Market is rapidly growing with internet, which is offering choice for customer. Internet technology makes it easier to discover what the customers want, understands the values that are important to individual customers, and implement cost-effective and results-driven CRM strategies. BNI as one of the major bank in Indonesia use the customer relationship management concept to maintain the existing customer to be a customer loyalty. The purpose of this research is to analyze how is the influence of CRM to the customer loyalty and to identify which factors of CRM such as promotion, lottery, event sponsorship and customer service consultant that have the most significant influence to the customer loyalty of BNI in Manado. The research method that used in this research associative with multiple linear regression analysis technique, as sample of the research 100 respondent taken from customers of BNI Manado. The finding revealed that only customer service consultant have significant effect to the customer loyalty of BNI Manado. They should pay attention on how to maintain this program, made the customer feels comfort by serving management, be friendly and providing helpful staff.

Keywords: customer relationship management, customer loyalty

INTRODUCTION

Competition happens in all business sectors. Each prospect opened for investor to compete with other. If the companies do not maintain that relationship with their customers, it is predictable that the customer will move to other companies. Therefore, many companies challenge to change their performance from product driven company to be a customer driven company. CRM able to improve the relationship of the companies with their customers in order to serves them better, and anticipate what will be required to serve them extremely well in future. The strength of CRM, by contrast, is that it recognizes that keeping customers over the long term is the road to profitability (Godin 1999:18). Goldenberg (2000) believes that CRM is not merely technology applications for marketing, sales and services but rather when it is successfully implemented; it enables firms to have cross functional, customer-driven, technology-integrated business process management strategy that maximizes relationships.

Chin et al (2003) stated that that due to many technological solutions available for CRM automation, it is often misconstrued as a piece of technology. But they maintained that in recent times many companies have realized the strategic importance of CRM, and as a result, it is becoming a business value-effort rather than technology-centric effort. Many businesses today realize the importance of CRM and its potential to help them achieve and sustain a competitive edge (Peppard, 2000). This view was further boosted by Bose (2002) that as a result of changing nature of the global environment and competition, firms cannot compete favorably with minor advantages and tricks that can easily be copied by competing firms. The implementation of CRM is an enabled opportunity to rise above minor advantages with real focus on developing actual relationships with customers.
Firms those are most successful at delivering what customers want are the more likely to be leaders of the future. Fayerman (2002) stated there are 4 factors that influence the CRM, such as promotion, lottery, event sponsorship and customer service consultant. A case stated above driven the researcher interest on analyzing the factors that can influence the customer loyalty.

Research Objectives
This part describes the objectives that would be achieved through research process and is not in the question form. The objectives of this research are:
1. To analyze the influence of promotion, lottery, event sponsorship and customer service consultant to customer loyalty of BNI
2. To identify which factor (promotion, lottery, event sponsorship and customer service consultant) that has the most significant influence to customer loyalty of BNI
3. To study about customer relationship management toward customer loyalty

THEORETIC FRAMEWORK

Customer Relationship Management
Kotler (2012:74) define CRM is the process of managing detailed information about individual customers and carefully managing all the customers ‘touch point’ with the aim of customer loyalty. CRM is a relatively recent strategy adopted in the marketing and sales domain. It is based on the fundamental belief on part of business practitioners that it is more cost effective to increase revenues through working with existing customers rather that to pursue growth through attracting new customers.

Customer Relationship Management Implementation
Fayerman, M. (2002) divided the CRM into three factors as follow:
1. Operational CRM
   Operational integration points exist to human resource systems for user data and ERP systems for transferring order information. Bose pointed out that CRM is an integration of technologies and business processes that are adopted to satisfy the needs of a customer during any given interaction through promotion, lottery, event sponsorship and customer service consultant.
   **Promotion** is the direct way an organization attempts to reach its publics and is performed through the five elements of promotion mix including advertising, sales promotion, personal selling, public relations, and direct marketing (Czinkota & Ronkainen, 2004). According to Kotler and Armstrong (2008), Promotion means activities that communicate the merits of the product and persuade the target customers to buy it.
   **Event Sponsorship** is a gathering of human beings, generally lasting from a few hours to a few days, and designed to celebrate, honour, sell, teach about or observe human endeavors (Matthews, 2008:140). Event promotion is thus a communication tool used by companies in order to reach its target on a given market.
   **Customer Service Consultant** According to Philip Kotler (2012:323), customer consultant is referring to data, information system, and advice services that the seller offers to buyers. According to Turban et al. (2002), customer service is a series of activities designed to enhance the level of customer satisfaction – that is, the feeling that a product or service has met the customer expectation.
   **Lottery (Coupon)** Dhar et al. (1996) found that on-pack coupons (similar to advertised coupon) can lead to higher market share than instant coupon since they are able to stimulate initial purchase and repurchase. In contrast, next-purchase coupons are increasingly being used in loyalty customer relationship management program.
2. Analytical CRM
   Builds on operational CRM and establishes information on customer segments, behaviour and value using statistical methods.
3. Collaborative CRM
   Concentrates on customer integration using a coordinated mix of interaction channels (multi-channel management).
Customer Loyalty

Hallowell (1996); Homburg and Giering (2001) stated that, customer loyalty has been perceived to be a behavioral concept entailing repeat buying of product or service measured as the series or share of purchases, referrals, magnitude of relationship or all of the above mingled together.

Previous Research

Sevcan Kirmaci (2012) finds that CRM affects customer loyalty in the banking sector. Bhisham Ramkelawon (2010) finds that CRM can be used as an integrated approach to bring out competitiveness in the banking sector. Yatish Joshi, Ehtesham Ahmad (2013) stated that CRM enables banking professionals to identify high net worth customers who bring more benefits.

Research Hypothesis

1. \( H_0 \): There is no influence between promotion, lottery, event sponsorship and customer service consultant towards customer loyalty.
2. \( H_1 \): Promotion, lottery, event sponsorship and customer service consultant influence the customer loyalty simultaneously.
3. \( H_2 \): Promotion influence the customer loyalty partially.
4. \( H_3 \): Lottery influence the customer loyalty partially.
5. \( H_4 \): Event sponsorship and attitudes influence the customer loyalty partially.
6. \( H_5 \): Customer service consultant influence the customer loyalty partially.

Conceptual Framework

\[ \text{Promotion (} X_1 \text{)}\]
\[ \text{Lottery (} X_2 \text{)}\]
\[ \text{Event Sponsorship (} X_3 \text{)}\]
\[ \text{Customer Service Consultant (} X_4 \text{)}\]
\[ \text{Customer Loyalty (} Y \text{)}\]

Figure 1. Conceptual Frameworks

Sources: Theoretical Review

RESEARCH METHOD

Type of Research

This research uses causal type of research. This type of research also determines if one variable causes another variable to occur or change. This research is to investigate the influence of Promotion, Lottery, Event Sponsorship and Customer Service Consultant toward customer loyalty of BNI Manado.
Place and Time of Research

The study was conducted in Manado on April 2014.

Population and Sample

The population refers to the entire group of people, events, or things of interest that the researcher wishes to investigate (Sekaran & Bougie, 2009:262). The population that are mainly observed in this current research is saving customer in BNI. The random sampling is from the questionnaire survey where the respondents were asked to fill the questionnaire directly. The sample of this research are customers of BNI as many as 100 customers or respondents.

Data Collection Method

Data collected first-hand for subsequent analysis to find solutions to the problem research (Sekaran & Bougie, 2009:262). The researcher gets primary data from the result of questionnaires. And to collect the secondary data, this researcher browsed the information through internet, marketing books and marketing journal. To collect primary data, this researcher does survey by spreading questionnaires to gather information. A questionnaire is a formal framework consisting of a set of questions and scales designed to generate primary raw data.

Data Analysis Method

Validity and Reliability

To analyze the validity of questionnaire, Pearson Product Moment is used. An instrument measure is valid if the instrument measure what ought to be measured. Validity for each variable is good where the values are above minimum level of 0.30. Reliability test is established by testing for both consistency and stability of the answer of questions. Alpha Cronbach is reliable coefficient that can indicate how good the items in asset have positive correlation one another (Sekaran and Bougie, 2009:262).

Multiple Regressions Analysis Method

The method of analysis used in this study is multiple regression models to approach the return. According to Sekaran (2005:177), multiple linear regression is used to find out the influence of independent variables on dependent variable. The formula of multiple linear regression is as follows:

\[ Y = \alpha + \beta X_1 + \beta X_2 + \beta X_3 + \beta X_4 + \varepsilon \]

Where:

\( \beta \) : Beta
\( \alpha \) : Alfa or constant
\( \varepsilon \) : Error
\( Y \) : Customer Loyalty
\( X_1 \) : Promotion
\( X_2 \) : Lottery
\( X_3 \) : Event Sponsorship
\( X_4 \) : Customer Service Consultant

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Result

Demographic Analysis

The researcher finds it is important to observe the demographic analysis of the research. There are 60% male respondents and 40% female respondents. The result indicates that male customers are mostly customers who visiting the bank. Age demographic, the respondent are divided into four age groups, that is those < 18 years old, 18 – 26 years old, 27 – 35 years old, and those > 35 years old. The highest number of respondents derived from age > 35 years old with 58% and the lowest number of respondents is age <18 years old as much as 8%. There are respondents 18 – 26 years old with 11% and the respondents 27 – 35 years old with 23%.
Occupation, most respondents occupation is private employee with 38%, followed by civil employee as much as 25%, retires and others shares the same 13% and the last is college student with 11%. From the interview to the respondent, other respondents mostly come from entrepreneurs, teachers, etc. Monthly income, from the respondent based on income the highest percentage with 67% derived from income Rp. 2.500.000 – Rp. 5.000.000. Then followed by income Rp. 1.000.000 – Rp. 2.500.000 (16%), income > Rp. 5.000.000 (10%), and the lowest income is < Rp. 1.000.000 as much as 7% of respondents. A student respondents gets their income from their parents. Information of product, the highest percentage with 59% derived from advertising, then family 25%, friends 13%, and other is 5%. Advertising is the biggest number among others respondent, and people know about the product by advertising from the bank itself.

Validity and Reliability
To analyze the validity of questionnaire, Pearson Product Moment is used. An instrument measure is valid if the instrument measure what ought to be measured. Validity for each variable is good where the values are above minimum level of 0.30. Reliability test is established by testing for both consistency and stability of the answer of questions. Consistency indicates how well the items in a set are positively correlated to one another (Sekaran & Bougie, 2009:162)

Multiple Regression Analysis

Table 2. Multiple Regression Result

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>.585</td>
<td>.287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotion</td>
<td>.111</td>
<td>.072</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lottery</td>
<td>.053</td>
<td>.066</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EventSponsorship</td>
<td>.086</td>
<td>.051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CustomerService</td>
<td>.619</td>
<td>.068</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SPSS data processed 2014.

Multiple Linear Regression model is used to determine the effect of several independent variables on a dependent variable. The computation was done by using the IBM SPSS 22.0 software. The computerized calculation ensures the accuracy of the analysis. From the result in the table 2, the model is defines as:

\[ Y = 0.585 + 0.111 X_1 + 0.053 X_2 + 0.086 X_3 + 0.619 X_4 \]

1. Constant \( b_0 \) 0.585 shows the effect of relationship between Promotion \( X_1 \), Lottery \( X_2 \), Event \( X_3 \), Customer Service \( x_4 \) to the Customer Loyalty \( Y \). It means if all independent variables are equal to zero then the Customer Loyalty \( Y \) is predicted to be 0.585

2. Consider other variables are constant or equal to zero, if there is one unit increasing in \( X_1 \) (Promotion) then the customer loyalty \( Y \) will increase 0.111.

3. Consider other variables are constant or equal to zero, if there is one unit increasing in \( X_2 \) (Lottery) then the customer loyalty \( Y \) will increase 0.053.

4. Consider other variables are constant or equal to zero, if there is one unit increasing in \( X_3 \) (Event) then the customer loyalty \( Y \) will increase 0.086.

5. Consider other variables are constant or equal to zero, if there is one unit increasing in \( X_4 \) (Customer Service) then the customer loyalty \( Y \) will increase 0.619.
Multiple Coefficient of Determination

(R^2) Table 3. Table R and R^2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.821^a</td>
<td>.675</td>
<td>.661</td>
<td>.379</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), CustomerService, EventSponsorship, Lottery, Promotion
b. Dependent Variable: Customer_Loyalty

Source: SPSS data processed, 2014.

The coefficient of determination (R^2) measures how far the ability of a model in explaining variation of dependent variable. The value of coefficients of determination is between 0 and 1. The coefficient of determination (R^2) of 0.675 shows that the linear relationship in this model is able to explain the customer loyalty (Y) for 67.5% while the rest 32.5% is explained by other factors not discussed in this research.

Hypothesis Test

F Test

F test is used to determine the whole effect of all independent variables to dependent variable. This test is done by comparing f_count with f_table. If f_count is higher than f_table, H_0 is rejected and H_1 is accepted.

Table 4. F-test Result

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Sum of squares</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Regression</td>
<td>28.350</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7.008</td>
<td>49.292</td>
<td>.000^b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>13.660</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>.144</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>42.010</td>
<td>99</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: Customer_Loyalty
b. Predictors: (Constant), CustomerService, EventSponsorship, Lottery, Promotion

Source: SPSS data processed, 2014.
The level of significant of 0.05 (α = 0.05) and degree of freedom (df) of 4; 95, the ftable from F distribution table is f4; 95; 0.05 = 2.467, while fcount from Table 4 is 49.292. The result is fcount > ftable = 49.292 > 2.467. This value shoes that overall independent variables namely: Promotion, Lottery, Event Sponsorship and Customer Service have strong and positive relationship with Customer Loyalty. Thus hypothesis is accepted.

T-Test

T-test is used to determine the partian effect of each independent variable to dependent variable. T-test value is obtained by comparing value of tcount with ttable. If tcount is higher that ttable, then H0 is rejected and H1 is accepted. The values of each variable are shown on the table below:

Table 5. T-Test Result

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>.585</td>
<td>.287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotion</td>
<td>.111</td>
<td>.072</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lottery</td>
<td>.053</td>
<td>.066</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EventSponsorship</td>
<td>.086</td>
<td>.051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CustomerService</td>
<td>.619</td>
<td>.068</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: Customer Loyalty

Source: SPSS data processed, 2014.

The partial influence for each independent variable will be explained as follows.

1. Promotion (X1) to Customer Loyalty (Y)
   - Reject H0 if tcount > ttable or Accept H0 if tcount < ttable
   - tcount of Promotion is 1.539. Since there is a level of significant 5%, then the t table will be t95:0.025 = 1.9852. By comparing the tcount with ttable: 1.539 < 1.9852 then the tcount is lower than ttable, meaning H0 is accepted and H1 is rejected. Thus, Promotion has no significant effect to customer loyalty.

2. Lottery (X2) to Customer Loyalty (Y)
   - Reject H0 if tcount > ttable or Accept H0 if tcount < ttable
   - tcount of Lottery is 0.807. Since there is a level of significant 5%, then the t table will be t95:0.025 = 1.9852. By comparing the tcount with ttable: 0.807 < 1.9852 then the tcount is lower than ttable, meaning H0 is accepted and H1 is rejected. Thus, Lottery has no significant effect to customer loyalty.

3. Event Sponsorship (X3) to Customer Loyalty (Y)
   - Reject H0 if tcount > ttable or Accept H0 if tcount < ttable
   - tcount of Event Sponsorship is 1.698. Since there is a level of significant 5%, then the t table will be t95:0.025 = 1.9852. By comparing the tcount with ttable: 1.698 < 1.9852 then the tcount is lower than ttable, meaning H0 is accepted and H1 is rejected. Thus, Event Sponsorship has no significant effect to customer loyalty.

4. Customer Service (X4) to Customer Loyalty (Y)
   - Reject H0 if tcount > ttable or Accept H0 if tcount < ttable
   - tcount of Customer Service is 9.170. Since there is a level of significant 5%, then the t table will be t95:0.025 = 1.9852. By comparing the tcount with ttable: 9.170 > 1.9852 then the tcount is higher than ttable, meaning H0 is rejected and H1 is accepted. Thus, Customer Service has a significant effect to customer loyalty.

From the explanation above, customer service is the most influencing factor to consumer loyalty. The beta value (regression coefficient) resulted from multiple linear regression analysis shows that variable of customer service has the highest value as much as 0.619 meaning this variables influences customer loyalty (Y) as much as 61.9%. This values is the highest compared with other variables toward customer loyalty. Thus, hypothesis is accepted.
Discussion

The research was conducted in Manado, especially in Bank Negara Indonesia. The total number of questionnaires is 100 derived from 100 respondents. The 100 questionnaires have been distributed among customers of Bank Negara Indonesia. The period of this research is in April 2014. The questionnaires were distributed to 100 respondents consisted of male and female respondent. There are more male respondents and less female respondent. The result indicates that male customers are mostly customers who visiting the bank.

This research is conducted with Multiple Linear Regression Model where this research has identified Customer Loyalty as the dependent variable and other characteristics such as Promotion, Lottery, Event Sponsorship, and Customer Service as the independent variables. From this research shows that all independent variables have a positive relationship with the Customer Loyalty as the dependent variable. Based on the Hypothesis Test, it clearly proves then that independent variable simultaneously influences dependent variable.

The most significant factor influencing customer loyalty at BNI is Customer Service. It’s a series of activities designed to enhance the level of customer satisfaction and advice services that the seller offers to buyers. People in Manado as respondent in this research have looked BNI as a product and services that is able to support what they needed. For the banks to be successful in the intensively competitive environment, they are bound to attach importance to customer satisfaction and loyalty. This research has a same result with Kirmaci (2012) that banking business can survive as long as they can meet the customers needs and enable customer satisfaction. Determining the consumer’s wishes and needs and meeting them is one of the ways of enabling consumer satisfaction. For this reason, CRM affects customer loyalty in the banking sector. It can be concluded that customer service consultant is the most important factors that can affects the customer loyalty. It has the highest value than other variables. The other variables such as promotion, lottery and event sponsorship also affects the customer loyalty partially.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

Conclusion
The final conclusions of this research are:
1. Promotion, lottery, event sponsorship and customer service influence dependent variables simultaneously.
2. Customer service has the most influencing factor on customer loyalty partially, compare to other independent variables.
3. Promotion has no significant effect to customer loyalty
4. Lottery has no significant effect to customer loyalty
5. Event sponsorship has no significant effect to customer loyalty

Recommendation
1. Promotional
   Most of the customers are continually saving their money because of one CRM program is promotional. A promotional is program that provides the endowment for customer, which is special gift, big promotion of product, and lottery. Therefore, Bank Negara Indonesia should keep the program and try to think more creatively design the program. For example, BNI be able to increase volume of advertising as promotion publicity, personal selling, and sales promotion. Based on data respondent about information of the product, 59% respondents choose advertising. It shows that people know about promotional program of the BNI by way of advertising.
2. Lottery
   Based on data respondent, lottery have no partial influence to customer loyalty. That because people saving their money at the bank mostly not because they interest in lottery bank provides. But still, lottery is one of CRM program. Therefore, Bank Negara Indonesia should be able to increase the customer interest in lottery. Besides the big lottery that held every year, BNI can make small lottery that drawn every month to keep customers continually saving their money and feels satisfied with the service.
3. Event Sponsorship

Most of the customers don’t pay much attention to event sponsorship held by Bank Negara Indonesia. Based on data, event sponsorship has no significant effect to customer loyalty but still, one of CRM program. BNI should pay more attention to event sponsorship to increase the customer loyalty, for example try to be more creative and more often in doing event sponsorship. BNI needs to increase their advertising, because based on data 59% respondent knows about BNI programs by advertising.

4. Customer Service

Bank Negara Indonesia needs to pay attention to Customer Service, because it variables becomes the most important factor affected the customer loyalty. They should pay attention on how to maintain this program, made the customer feels comfort by serving CS, be friendly and providing helpful staff. These things will give more opportunity to have customer become loyal.

REFERENCES


